

“BABEȘ-BOLYAI” UNIVERSITY CLUJ-NAPOCA

FACULTY OF HISTORY AND PHILOSOPHY

SUMMARY OF THE Ph.D. THESIS

THE REFORM OF THE UNITED NATIONS SECURITY

COUNCIL AND CONFLICT MANAGEMENT

SCIENTIFIC COORDINATOR

Prof. Vasile Pușcaș, Ph.D.

Ph.D. CANDIDATE

Cristina Alina Mureșan

2011

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....	1
LIST OF FIGURES.....	2
INTRODUCTION.....	3
CHAPTER 1. THEORETICAL AND CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK.....	6
<i>1.1 Justification of the comparative approach and case studies</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>1.2 The (neo)realist paradigm.....</i>	<i>9</i>
<i>1.3 The constructivist paradigm.....</i>	<i>13</i>
<i>1.4 Operationalizations and research topics.....</i>	<i>15</i>
<i>1.4.1 General overview on the dimensions of the Security Council reform</i>	<i>15</i>
<i>1.4.2 (Neo)realist hypotheses</i>	<i>17</i>
<i>1.4.3 Constructivist hypotheses.....</i>	<i>19</i>
<i>1.5 Methodology.....</i>	<i>21</i>
CHAPTER 2. UN SECURITY COUNCIL REFORM BETWEEN REALISM AND CONSTRUCTIVISM.	24
<i>2.1 Case studies analysis using the (neo)realist approach.....</i>	<i>24</i>
<i>2.1.1 Germany and Japan: interest and power in formulating foreign policy</i>	<i>25</i>
<i>2.1.1.1 The German foreign policy.....</i>	<i>25</i>
<i>2.1.1.2 The Japanese foreign policy.....</i>	<i>28</i>
<i>2.1.1.3 Arguments for including Germany and Japan as Security Council members</i>	<i>30</i>
<i>2.1.2 The influence of small third-world states in the UN.....</i>	<i>33</i>
<i>2.2 Case studies analysis using the constructivist approach</i>	<i>35</i>
<i>2.2.1 Identities and norms in formulating national interests in Germany and Japan </i>	<i>35</i>
<i>2.2.1.1 Post-war antimilitarist identities.....</i>	<i>37</i>
<i>2.2.1.2 Explanations on Germany's and Japan's failure to become Security Council members.....</i>	<i>42</i>

2.2.2 <i>Third-world democratic identity as a limitation for the realist logic in the Security Council. The relevance of discursive power.....</i>	44
--	----

CHAPTER 3. THE EVOLUTION OF THE SECURITY COUNCIL REFORM

PROCESS	47
3.1 <i>The UN's and Security Council's role in the international system.....</i>	47
3.2 <i>The dimensions of the Security Council reform</i>	50
3.2.1 <i>Arguments to reform the Security Council</i>	50
3.2.2 <i>Issues related to legitimacy and representativeness.....</i>	53
3.2.3 <i>Procedural aspects related to the reform of the Security Council</i>	56
3.2.4 <i>The chronology of the reform proposals</i>	61
3.3 <i>Concrete proposals to reform the Security Council</i>	86
3.3.1 <i>Areas of the reform</i>	86
3.3.2 <i>The 1991/163 resolution as potential precedent for the Security Council reform.....</i>	97
3.3.3 <i>Alternatives for the Security Council reform.....</i>	100
3.4 <i>The American perspective on the Security Council reform. A (neo)realist analysis ...</i>	101
3.5 <i>The possibility of a common European Union permanent seat in the Security Council. A constructivist analysis</i>	104

CHAPTER 4. UNITED NATIONS' EFFICIENCY IN MANAGING

INTERNATIONAL CONFLICTS	107
4.1 <i>The UN's achievements in maintaining global peace and security</i>	107
4.1.1 <i>The international security environment at the beginning of the 21st century.....</i>	111
4.1.2 <i>The role of the cultural factor in the UN multilateral negotiations</i>	114
4.2 <i>The relationship between Security Council reform and UN's efficiency in conflict management</i>	128
4.3 <i>The effects of the veto power on UN's efficiency in conflict management. A (neo)realist analysis</i>	131
4.4 <i>Competitive norms in UN's institutional identity. A constructivist analysis</i>	133

CHAPTER 5. THE GLOBAL ECONOMIC CRISIS AND ITS EFFECTS ON THE UN.....	137
5.1 <i>General overview on the global economic crisis. The UN financial reform</i>	137
5.2 <i>G20 as potential catalyst for the Security Council reform</i>	139
5.2.1 <i>The G20 emergency in the international system and its relationship with G8</i>.....	139
5.2.2 <i>The relationship between UN and G20</i>.....	141
5.3 <i>The future of the Security Council reform</i>	142
CONCLUSIONS.....	145
BIBLIOGRAPHY	151

Key -words: the reform of the UN Security Council; UN and conflict management; (neo) realism; constructivism; the relationship between UN and G20; The United States and Security Council reform

At the beginning of the 21st century, UN's role in the international system is not clearly defined. There are many critical voices towards the efficiency of the organization, that pressure for its reform. Among the UN's bodies, the Security Council (SC) has a privileged place. While some authors see it as „a global government”, whose main role is maintaining international peace and security¹, other authors see it as „a Great Powers' Club”, in which the Powers use the Council to promote their own interests.²

The paper consists of two dimensions. *The theoretical dimension* refers to the Security Council reform using the comparative approach, confronting one of the most influent and traditional theories in the international relations (IR), (neo)realism, with a more recent paradigm, considered one of the main competitive approaches to realism- constructivism. The reasons for choosing a comparative approach include the need for a broader understanding of the research topic, and the limited capacity of the IR theories to explain complex variables.³ *The empirical dimension* includes the operationalization of the two dependent variables: the main dependent variable, Security Council reform, and the secondary dependent variable, UN's effectiveness in managing international conflicts. This dimension also refers to the analysis of a number of case studies: each chapter uses the realist and the constructivist approaches to analyze a case study for each paradigm, the exception being the second chapter, which uses both theories to analyze each case study.

First chapter presents the two theories, their main concepts, the research hypothesis and the methodology.

The second chapter analyzes three case studies using both paradigms: Germany and Japan, as emergent powers aspiring for a permanent place in the

¹ See Maurice Bertrand, L'ONU, Paris, La Decouverte, 2000, pp. 110-112

² See James Paul, *Security Council reform: arguments about the future of the United Nations system*, 1995, pp. 3-5, available on the Internet, <http://www.globalpolicy.org/security/pubs/secref.htm#veto>, la 15.5.2011

³ See Daniel Maliniak et al., “International relations in the US Academy”, *International Studies Quarterly*, 55, 2011, pp.441-442

Security Council, and the group of the third-world small states, striving to limitate Great-Powers' domination and obtain an equal voice in the SC.

The third chapter operationalizes the main dependent variable, the Security Council reform, into five areas: the reform of the SC's membership, including the size of an enlarged Council and categories of membership; the reform of the veto system; the reform of the SC's working methods; the relations between the SC and the UN General Assembly (GA).⁴ This chapter includes a detailed chronological presentation of the reform proposals and of the main technical and legal aspects related to the SC's reform. This section of the paper investigates two case studies: a (neo)realist analysis of the United States' perspective on the SC's reform, and a constructivist analysis of a potential common permanent seat for the European Union in the SC.

The fourth chapter operationalizes the secondary dependent variable, UN's effectiveness in managing international conflicts and investigates the relation between this variable and the SC's reform. This chapter includes a detailed analysis of the UN's achievements in conflict management, in the 21st century security environment. This section of the paper investigates two case studies: the influence of the veto power on the UN's effectiveness in conflict management, using the (neo)realist approach, and a constructivist analysis of two competing norms in the UN's institutional identity: the right to national sovereignty *vs.* human rights protection.

The fifth chapter presents the recent international developments related to the SC's reform, that is, the influence of the global economic crisis on the UN and SC's reform, as well as the emergent G20 as a potential alternative forum to debate SC's reform. This chapter ends with a number of conclusions on the future of the reform on short and medium term, considering the further evolution of G20, US policy towards SC's reform and the potential for a positive evolution of the reform process inside the UN.

The paper presents two categories of conclusions. The theoretical conclusions relate to an existing trend in IR theory, that suggests using more than one paradigm for a complete analysis, rather than a one theory- based approach.⁵ On this line, the

⁴ See Jacob Silas Lund, *Pros and Cons of Security Council Reform*, Center for UN Reform Education, 19 January 2010, available at www.centerforunreform.org.

⁵ See Daniel Maliniak et al., "International relations in the US Academy", *International Studies Quarterly*, 55, 2011, pp.441-442

paper argues that the comparative approach using realism and constructivism was a useful research tool for a complete understanding of the main dependent variable, the SC's reform.

The empirical conclusions were derived from the case studies' analysis and the operationalization of the the two dependent variables.

In regards to the main dependent variable, the reform of the SC, there was one area of the reform that appeared to be the most significant: the reform of the SC's membership. There is a general consensus among the reformist group, that the membership of the Council should better reflect the current distribution of power in the international system, in order to increase the general effectiveness of the organization. The concrete reform proposals in this area should maintain a balance between the principle of equal representation and the real capabilities of the member states.

The study of the SC's reform proposals showed a slow progress of the entire process. Moreover, the dynamics of the negotiations related to the reform suggest that the continuation of the process is related to the willingness of the main interest groups (G4, „Uniting for Consensus”, The African Group), to make concessions and to a more active participation from the United States of America. Also, the (neo)realist analysis of the US perspective on the SC's reform revealed that any reform proposal needs the American support to be successfully implemented.

The case studies from the second chapter offered a number of relevant conclusions. The (neo)realist approach was useful in the identification of interests that motivated Germany and Japan to seek permanent seats in the Security Council. On the other hand, the constructivist approach offered possible explanations of Germany's and Japan's failure to obtain a permanent seat, considering their post-war antimilitarist identities. The case study involving the group of third-world small countries's influence in the UN was an opportunity to investigate the relationships between the SC and the GA, showing how the distribution of power in the international system is reflected inside the UN, through the roles of the two bodies. While the GA is a democratic forum of all member states, SC is an exclusive Great Powers' club. The same group of countries was investigated using the constructivist approach, to show the influence of the discursive power inside the GA, as an instrument to influence the SC's behavior.

The case study referring to a potential common permanent seat for the European Union inside the SC, demonstrated the influence of creating the Common Security and Defense Policy (CSDP) and of the Lisbon Treaty, in defining a common foreign policy identity for the EU. Further on, this emerging identity alters the positions of France and the United Kingdom, the only European permanent members in the SC, and pressures them to support the extension of Council, as a way to legitimize their own position, in relation to the aspiring permanent member, Germany.

The study of the debate between two competing norms in the UN's institutional identity, the right to sovereignty vs. the protection of human rights, revealed how these norms created an ambiguity in the UN's identity, and further on negatively influenced UN's effectiveness in managing international conflicts, through fear of UN's lack of impartiality.

The operationalization of the secondary dependent variable, UN's effectiveness in managing international conflicts, showed that the SC's extension may positively influence the efficiency, depending on the concrete reform model for the Council. The case study on the influence of the veto power related to the secondary dependent variable, revealed that the first was one of the main factors in the negative outcomes of the UN's peacekeeping operations. The study suggested that a reform of the veto system, although unlikely on the short and medium term, may positively influence the efficiency.

The study of the SC's reform, especially the reform of the Council's membership, offered an opportunity to investigate the global distribution of power and the current balance of power. The paper concludes that the dynamic related to the SC's reform reflects the systemic transformations and tendencies.

The analysis of the existing reform proposals recommends the intermediary solution of expanding the Security Council through the creation of a set of new permanent and nonpermanent seats with extended mandate, reevaluated before receiving a final seat. Such a proposal, the paper argues, might benefit from the support of the main interest groups and might create a context to include (in the SC) the relevant states for an effective global governance. Moreover, the attempts to reform the SC are connected to the current efforts to adapt the global institutions to the transformations of the international system. The failure of this process might

increase the political and economic instability and decrease the global effectiveness of managing international conflicts.