Doctoral Thesis

Alexander Pope *Essay on Man*
- Early Hungarian Reception -

**Doctoral Supervisor:**
Prof. Dr. Egyed Emese

**Doctoral Candidate:**
Erzse Melinda

CLUJ-NAPOCA
2010
SUMMARY

The aim of the thesis entitled *Alexander Pope’s Essay on Man - Early Hungarian Reception* - is to research the way this poem by Alexander Pope was received in the literary environment, especially the Hungarian translation of this poem and its influence on the development of national literature and Enlightenment thought in the 18th century.

The paper presents the Enlightenment with its many facets and manifestations in different national and European cultural environments, showing that literature was the most significant means of spreading this philosophical movement the 18th century. At the time, the translation of literary works from English into French, then into German, assumed a special role in conveying the Enlightenment ideas to Eastern European nations. Given the geographical distance and their lack of direct contact with England, the latter managed to assimilate the Enlightenment thinking mostly via French. The choice of the literary works to be translated and the way in which these translations were made (mostly after translations into French, giving rise to erroneous translations in verse or prose, adaptations, and even imitations) brings into discussion political issues, as well as questions regarding the development of the language of Eastern European nations, the majority of which were under the dominance of the court in Vienna. For these nations, Enlightenment meant not only the hope of social change, but more than that, awareness of the fact that language is the defining element of a nation, making it imperative to use and develop it with a view to social development.
Alexander Pope’s *Essay on Man*, seen as the quintessence of the Enlightenment and a masterpiece of versification, has given rise to numerous translations.

The present thesis points out the fact that the Hungarian translations of *Essay on Man*, are part of the European trend of translations via an intermediary language, translations stemming from the desire to import the Enlightenment thinking, as well as the socio-cultural development of the western-European countries in the 18th century. In light of the ideas mentioned above, the present research focuses on the following topics: the Enlightenment: philosophy and literary trends; Translations during the Enlightenment: theory and practice; The reception and translations of the poem *Essay on Man*.

**Chapter I. – The Enlightenment: philosophy and literary trends** is meant to present the characteristics of the Enlightenment in Western Europe, its specificity at national level, as well as the literary trends of the time.

The analysis of the general characteristics of the Enlightenment answers questions related to the specific trend of thinking of the 18th century, justifying the huge wave of interest sparked by the poem *Essay on Man*, which has generated a genuine literary phenomenon manifested in a variety of translations. This chapter examines how the ideas of the Enlightenment applied to the context of the 18th century, and how they were received in different countries and by different nations. We noted that the general features of the Enlightenment were to be found in all countries, however, accompanied by manifestations specific to each of them, generated by the particular socio-political context. The Enlightenment is considered the most important philosophical movement in Europe, because it has generated a radical change in thinking. The new discoveries in various fields of science managed to question all the rules and norms generally accepted by society before, leading to a refusal to accept them any further. In the Enlightenment mode of thinking, man is placed in the forefront, and the focus is on his freedom and welfare that lead to tolerance and the welfare of society as a whole. In the European social context, the Netherlands and England served as a model for Europe as a whole. The close commercial and intellectual links between Britain and France facilitated the dissemination of the Enlightenment ideas throughout Europe. The written word, be it in
the form of meditation on a specific topic, of letter writing, press, or any form of literature, acquired major importance in the spread of the new trend of thinking. Intellectuals educated abroad followed closely all social changes in Western Europe and reported on these changes to their homeland in Eastern Europe by letters or in the newspapers, sending home original literary works or their translations.

The most popular literary genre of the 18th century was the essay in verse or prose, due to the fact that the essay lends itself best to reflection and contemplation, which were a particularity of the period. In Hungarian literature, the essay was mostly in the form of letters in verse to friends, letters that not only reflected the mode of thinking of the intellectuals, but also described the social context in which they were written. The political context, censorship by the court in Vienna, the relationship between the Hungarian nobility and the Vienna court, and the absence of Hungarian bourgeoisie were all aspects that justified the apprehension expressed by scholars to the idea of having their writings published. In this context, the fervent activity of Bessenyei György for the welfare of the nation was of outstanding importance, given that he acknowledged that national literature and the publication of literary works written in Hungarian and of translations into Hungarian were crucial to the development of language, to crystallizing national awareness, and therefore to achieving progress of the nation and of society as a whole.

Chapter II – Translations during the Enlightenment: Theory and Practice, analyses the way literary translation was seen in the 18th century, focusing on the translation techniques used at the time and on the quality of the translations. The concept of translation itself places these translations in the vast area of translations, adaptations and even imitation, explaining the specificity of this literary genre at a time when there was a keen interest in finding and establishing a number of general rules that would be valid and applicable to a theory of translation. However, by the end of the century, the only concrete result of these thoughts was an increased interest in language and in the relationship between the original literary work, its translation, and the author, translator and reader.
For the Eastern European nations, the fundamental concepts of the Enlightenment, its major concern for man and his right to knowledge, freedom, prosperity, and justice, led to an increased need to define themselves as nations. It was at this time that the Eastern European peoples were in full process of defining their nation and nationality through language. The intellectuals of the time started to realize the importance of the literary development and use of national language for literary purposes.

The analysis of the translations and translation theories that started emerging at the time shows that Western European translators and poets were not the only ones concerned with the study of translation, with the attempt to achieve a generally applicable theory of translation and to raise awareness of differences between languages. The ideas, expressed particularly in forewords to translations, explain and analyze the obstacles encountered in the act of translation. These opinions would often raise controversy among the translators of the time. Just as Western translators, Hungarian translators showed their concern with translation and acknowledged the need to establish a number of generally valid rules of translation. These ideas are also expressed in prefaces to translations, and the majority conclude that enriching national language is imperative. We may say that the dominant feature of the 18th century is its concern for language. In the Hungarian literary environment, this phenomenon raises two closely related issues: enriching language and disseminating the ideas of the Enlightenment through translations, on the one hand, and having Hungarian writings published, on the other.

Therefore, the translation of literary works in Western Europe becomes an important factor in the process of defining the Hungarian nation, especially since the development of the Hungarian language is closely connected to the reception of the Enlightenment ideas. Literary translations from English into French assume an important role in conveying the ideas of the Enlightenment Mediation through French proved essential for the east-European nations, whose scholars assimilated the western ideas via French.

The choice of the literary works to be translated and the way in which these translations were made, brings into discussion political issues, as well as questions regarding the development of the language. The Hungarian Enlightenment, just as that of other nations in this part of Europe, had as its most important accomplishment awareness
of the fact that language is the defining factor of a nation, that its usage and development are paramount.

Chapter III - Reception and translations of the poem *Essay on Man* analyzes the way Alexander Pope’s masterpiece was received in various national contexts. This chapter focuses on two major questions: on the one hand, the reason why precisely this literary work was chosen for translation by scholars from so many countries, and on the other hand, if the so-called “mistakes” in Bessenyei György’s translations are the translator’s fault or if they are due to the lack of development of the Hungarian language at the time, or to the faulty French translations used by Bessenyei as source texts for his translations. The poem *Essay on Man*, written under the sign of excellence and perfection, was seen by Pope himself a synthesis of the ideas and concerns characteristic of the 18th century Enlightenment. The philosophic ideas underlying this essay encompass the Enlightenment thinking as such, the mind frame of the time, the issue of faith questioned by the new scientific discoveries, in a word, everything that had to do with the way of thinking in the 18th century.

The act of thinking, as the basis of self-knowledge and knowledge of the surrounding world, the rational understanding of the ways of the world and acceptance of it on the basis of these considerations, the well-defined role and place of the human being in the universe, self-knowledge as a starting point in explaining God’s ways, the relationship between man (the individual) and society, virtue as a source of happiness, evil and injustice as inherent parts of the world - these are just some of the controversial topics of the 18th century. Therefore, the poem *Essay on Man* stems from the ideas of the Enlightenment and from issues of faith, characteristic for the period. This is one of the reasons why Hungarian intellectuals have found in translating this work a way of disseminating the Enlightenment ideas, bypassing censorship imposed by the court of Vienna.

We showed in the previous chapter, that the fundamental characteristic of 18th century translations is their distance from the original text, its transformation through translation. This translation technique was used in many translations of *Essay on Man*, regardless of target language or translator.
The first two translations of the poem into French date from 1736, just two years after the publication of the original, one by Silhouette in prose, and one by Du Resnel in verse, both inaccurate. These two translations, which involved Pope in dangerous controversy at the time, served as source texts for translators such as Bessenyei, who did not know English, and who only used these French texts for their translations, thus moving further and further away from the original text and consequently from the meaning of Pope's verses.

Another question raised by Bessenyei’s translations of *Essay on Man* is that of the source texts and editions used by him, given that neither in the case of the first translation in 1772 entitled *Az embernek Próbája*, nor in the case of the other translations in 1803 entitled *Az Ember Poémában*, does the Hungarian poet mention the French source of his translation. In the preface to his second translation, we learn that he used a French text entitled *Essai sur l'Homme* as source text for his translation, but nowhere does he mention the author of the French translation, the publisher, or year of publication.

We tried to identify the source-text(s) of Bessenyei’s translation by comparing it to the French translations by Silhouette and by Du Resnel, considered by Hungarian literary historians to be the two source-texts used parallelly by the Hungarian translator. Special attention was given to the identification of the editions of these French translations that could come into question: the first hypothesis is that Bessenyei used the first, separate editions of Silhouette’s and Du Resnel’s translations, both entitled *Essai sur l’Homme*; the second hypothesis is that Bessenyei used the edition published by Trattner in Vienna in 1761 under the title *Oeuvres Diverses de Pope*; the third hypothesis is that of the edition published one year later, in 1762, by König in Strasbourg under the title *Essai sur l’Homme*.

It is important to identify the source-text(s) as well as the edition used by Bessenyei for his translation, because the foremost aim of this research is to observe the way in which Bessenyei managed to translate, by using French translations as source-texts, the *Essay on Man* and the meaning intended by Pope in this poem.

The analysis of the translations does not aim to point out their inexactness or failures, but to show how the Enlightenment thought was moulded and transposed by the translators of this poem, often limited by political or language constraints. Bessenyei’s
aim was not necessarily to create a perfect literary translation, as art for art’s sake, but to make the Enlightenment thought available for the Hungarian readers.

As a result of the comparative analysis of the English original text of the *Essay on Man*, of the two French translations by Silhouette and by Du Resnel (and the different editions mentioned earlier, and of the Hungarian translation we can draw two conclusions: the one is that Bessenyei used both French translations parallelly, the other is that he did not use the 1761 edition of the *Oeuvres Diverses de Pope* (Trattner, Vienna). With no other evidence regarding the edition used by Bessenyei, we can not exclude either possibility: neither that he used the two first, separate editions (or later, identical ones) of Silhouette’s and Du Resnel’s translations, nor hat he used the 1762 edition entitled *Essai sur l’Homme* (König, Strasbourg). It is impossible to exclude either possibility, because in the König-edition the two French translations (Silhouette’s and Du Resnel’s) are identical with their first, separate editions. Moreover, the title of this volume is *Essai sur l’Homme*, title that corresponds with the title indicated by Bessenyei as source of his translation. Another argument in this respect is the fact that in this volume next to the English original text of the *Essay on Man* and the two French translations considered by us, there are three other translations (a German, an Italian, a Latin one); Kretsch’s German translation could also have been of help to Bessenyei in understanding the profound meaning of Pope’s verses. On the grounds of these arguments we consider this edition the one used by Bessenyei for his work.

The last part of the thesis concentrates on the way in which Pope’s *Essay on Man* was received in Europe and analyses the way it was translated. In the time span from the poem’s first publication in 1734 and its first French translation in 1736, to the middle of the 19th century more than fifty translations were made into French, Italian, Dutch, German, Latin, Portuguese, Polish, and Russian. The present thesis comes to complete the international inventory of the translations of the *Essay on Man* (according to the 18th century definition of translations we consider translation at this point translations in prose, adaptations, fragments) with the nine Hungarian Translations born in the same time span. These translations prove that in the years of the Enlightenment and the years that follow, the Hungarian intellectuals were in touch with the European thinking and philosophical trends, and, overcoming the socio-political and language limitations, they
strove, through translations and original literary works, to import the Enlightenment ideas as well as the socio-cultural development of the western-European countries into the Hungarian socio-cultural milieu of the 18th century.
The Editions of the Translations of the
*Essay on Man* by Alexander Pope
- the source-texts of Bessenyei's translations -

- **Silhouette**
  - *L'Essai sur l'Homme par Mr. Pope* 1736
  - *Essai sur l'Homme poème philosophique par Alexandre Pope en cinque langues* Strasbourg, König 1762

- **Du Resnel**
  - *Essai sur l'Homme* 1736
  - *Principes de la Morale et du Goût* 1737
  - *Oeuvres Diverses de Pope traduites de l'Anglois Vienne, Trattner* 1761

- **Bessenyei**
  - *Az embernek próbája* Béts., 1772
  - *Az ember poémában az anglus Pópnak elméje szerint* 1803
I. Primary Sources


[Jean Paul de] Crousaz Examen de l’Essai de Mr. Pope, sur l’Homme, par Mr. De Crousaz, membre des Académies royales des Sciences de Paris et de Bordeaux. Lausanne. 1737.


The Iliad of Homer, Translated by Mr. POPE. Vol.1. London: W. Bowyer for Bernard Lintott, 1715.
http://rpo.library.utoronto.ca/display/displayprose.cfm?prosenum=15


[Voltaire] *Lettres Philosophiques* Par M. de V*** . A Amsterdam Chez E. Lucas, ou Livre d’or, 1734.


**II. Secondary Sources**


http://andromeda.rutgers.edu/~jlynch/Texts/pope.html


